

March 22, 2017

Michael S. Piwowar  
Acting Chairman  
U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission  
100 F Street, NE  
Washington, DC 20549-1090

***Re: Reconsideration of Pay Ratio Rule Implementation***

Dear Acting Chairman Piwowar,

We are writing as investors and investor organizations collectively representing \$3 trillion in assets under management to express our continued support for Section 953(b) of the Dodd-Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act of 2010—the “pay ratio” disclosure requirement—and the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission’s August 5, 2015 final rule implementing this provision.

We strongly urge the SEC to maintain the effective date for disclosure by companies as stated in the final rule for “the first fiscal year beginning on or after January 1, 2017” which, for most companies, will mean in their 2018 proxy statements. Delaying the implementation of the rule will do a huge disservice to investors who have already waited nearly seven years for this material information.

The SEC’s pay ratio disclosure rule is thoughtful, balanced, and carefully crafted to provide companies considerable flexibility and makes accommodations to them in complying with the rule, while giving shareowners valuable new information with which to assess companies in their investment portfolio. Moreover, the SEC’s rule encourages companies to offer additional context for their pay ratio disclosures.

As investors, we believe that pay ratio information is material because it:

- Enables investors to make more informed decisions when casting advisory votes on executive compensation (“Say-On-Pay” votes). There is evidence that shareholders consider pay ratios as a measure of CEO pay reasonableness. A 2016 study of commercial banks that disclose average employee pay data found that companies with the highest pay ratios experienced “significantly greater shareholder dissent on SOP votes.”<sup>1</sup>
- Provides employee pay data that is otherwise difficult and costly for investors to obtain on their own. Companies are not currently required to disclose data on their employees’ compensation, and the required disclosure of median employee pay will encourage greater

---

<sup>1</sup> Steven S. Crawford and Karen K. Nelson, *Mind the Gap: CEO-Employee Pay Ratios and the Shareholder Say on Pay Votes*, January 2016. Available at [https://www8.gsb.columbia.edu/faculty-research/sites/faculty-research/files/CNR%20Jan2016%20\(002\).pdf](https://www8.gsb.columbia.edu/faculty-research/sites/faculty-research/files/CNR%20Jan2016%20(002).pdf)

transparency of human capital metrics. In the absence of company specific disclosures, investors are attempting to obtain human capital management data from companies.<sup>2</sup>

- Indicates a company's approach to balancing internal equity and external competitiveness when setting CEO pay targets. An overreliance on peer group benchmarking can contribute to a ratcheting up effect on CEO pay levels, leading one academic paper to conclude that "internal consistency, or pay equity, throughout the organization, up to and including the CEO, should be a natural and reasonable objective."<sup>3</sup>
- Sheds light on the impact of high CEO to employee pay ratios on employee morale. Public company employees are generally aware how much they make relative to their CEO, and high pay disparities may impact employee productivity. Wide pay gaps between CEOs and other employees are associated with higher employee turnover, which can adversely affect a company's performance and thereby shareholder interests.<sup>4</sup>
- Allows investors to see how pay ratios change at specific companies over time, and how companies within industries vary in their employee compensation strategies. Such disclosure can help inform investment decisions. According to a 2016 MSCI study, companies with higher CEO to employee pay gaps experienced lower profitability compared with peers with smaller pay gaps over a 5-year period from 2009 to 2014.<sup>5</sup>

For these reasons, pay ratio disclosure will provide material information to investors who are concerned about CEO and employee compensation and its impact on shareholder value. We call on the SEC to comply with Section 953(b) of the Dodd-Frank Act by maintaining the existing pay ratio disclosure rule. We note that this rule was adopted after an extensive rulemaking process and comment period. Any further delay will impose significant costs on investors who have been anticipating pay ratio disclosure according to the rule's existing timetable.

Sincerely,

---

<sup>2</sup> David McCann, *Big Leap Forward for Human Capital Disclosure*, CFO.com, May 20, 2016. Available at <http://ww2.cfo.com/disclosure/2016/05/big-leap-forward-human-capital-disclosure/>. See also Pensions & Investments Research Consultants Ltd. comment letter to the SEC, October 17, 2013. Available at <https://www.sec.gov/comments/s7-07-13/s70713-230.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> Charles M. Elson and Craig K. Ferrere, *Executive Superstars Peer Groups and Overcompensation – Cause Effect and Solution*, Journal of Corporation Law, Spring 2013. Available at <http://lerner.udel.edu/centers/research-centers/john-l-weinberg-center-for-corporate-governance/executive-superstars-peer-groups-and-overcompensation/>

<sup>4</sup> Matt Bloom and John Michael, *The Relationships Among Organizational Context, Pay Dispersion, and Managerial Turnover*, Academy of Management Journal, February 2002. Available at <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3069283>. See also James Wade, Charles O'Reilly III, and Timothy Pollock, *Overpaid CEOs and Underpaid Managers: Fairness and Executive Compensation*, Organization Science, October 2006. Available at <http://dx.doi.org/10.1287/orsc.1060.0204>

<sup>5</sup> Samuel Block, *Income Inequality and the Intracorporate Pay Gap*, MSCI, April 2016. Available at <https://www.msci.com/www/research-paper/income-inequality-and-the/0337258305>

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 3

Paul Lee  
*Head of Corporate Governance*  
Aberdeen Asset Management

Kathy Woods  
*Chair*  
Adrian Dominican Sisters  
Portfolio Advisory Board

Richard L. Trumka  
*President*  
AFL-CIO

Keith Mestrich  
*President*  
Amalgamated Bank

John Keenan  
*Corporate Governance Analyst*  
American Federation of State, County  
and Municipal Employees

Lisa Donner  
*Executive Director*  
Americans for Financial Reform

Rosanna Landis Weaver  
*Program Manager, Power of the Proxy,*  
*Executive Compensation*  
As You Sow

Ron Perrone  
*Director*  
ASB Capital Management LLC

Colette Murphy  
*Executive Director*  
Atkinson Foundation

Marie-Diane Deslauriers  
*Senior Manager - Institutional Markets*  
Batirente

RJ Devick  
*President*  
Bond & Devick Wealth Partners

Mary Ellen Madden  
*Shareholder Representative*  
BVM Shareholder Education &  
Action Group

Anne Simpson  
*Investment Director*  
CalPERS

Stephen Viederman  
*Advisee*  
Christopher Reynolds Foundation

Shelley Alpern  
*Director of Social Research &*  
*Shareholder Advocacy*  
Clean Yield Asset Management

Charley Beresford  
*Executive Director*  
Columbia Foundation

James A Frazin  
*Co-founder and CEO*  
Communitas Financial Planning Inc.

George Schmitz  
*Director Corporate Responsibility*  
Congregation of Holy Cross  
Moreau Province

Sally Ann Brickner, OSF  
*Coordinator of Justice, Peace and*  
*Integrity of Creation*  
Congregation of St. Agnes

Margaret Weber  
*Corporate Responsibility Director*  
Congregation of St. Basil

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 4

Karen Watson, CFA  
*Chief Investment Officer*  
Congregation of St. Joseph

Elizabeth Davis  
*Congregational Leader*  
Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy  
of Newfoundland

Carol Thomas  
*Interim Chair - Investment Advisory Council*  
Connecticut Retirement Plans and  
Trust Funds

Dieter Waizenegger  
*Executive Director*  
CtW Investment Group

Ann Roberts  
*ESG Analyst*  
Dana Investment Advisors

Sister Louise Gallahue, D.C.  
*Provincial*  
Daughters of Charity, Province of St. Louise

Mary Brigid Clingman, OP  
*Promoter of Justice*  
Dominican Sisters of Grand Rapids

Eileen Gannon  
*Leadership Team Member*  
Dominican Sisters of Sparkill

Cesare Vitali  
*Head of ESG Research*  
Ecofi Investissement

Jeff Pym  
*Executive Director*  
Evangelical Lutheran Foundation of  
Eastern Canada

Susan Ernster, FSPA  
*Treasurer and CFO*  
Franciscan Sisters of Perpetual Adoration

Jeffery Perkins  
*Executive Director*  
Friends Fiduciary Corporation

David Schreiber  
*Investment Advisor and Financial Planner*  
Greenvest

Todd Walker  
*Financial Advisor*  
Greenvest

John Harrington  
*President and CEO*  
Harrington Investments, Inc.

Patricia Grant  
*Provincial Leader*  
Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary  
Canadian Province

Josh Zinner  
*CEO*  
Interfaith Center on Corporate Responsibility

Gary R Allen  
*General Vice President*  
International Association of Machinists and  
Aerospace Workers

Sharan Burrow  
*General Secretary*  
International Trade Union Confederation

David Cohen  
*President*  
J. Zechner Associates Inc.

Christine Jantz  
*President*  
Jantz Management LLC

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 5

Jeffrey Scales  
*Managing Principal*  
JSA Financial Group

Clare Payn  
*Head of Corporate Governance*  
*North America*  
Legal & General Investment Management

Larisa Ruoff  
*Director of Shareholder Advocacy*  
*and Corporate Engagement*  
The Sustainability Group of  
Loring, Wolcott & Coolidge

Scott Zdrazil  
*Senior Investment Officer –*  
*Corporate Governance*  
Los Angeles County Employees  
Retirement Association

William Gee  
*President and Director*  
Manaaki Foundation

Joseph P. La Mar  
*Assistant CFO*  
Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers

Cathy Rowan  
*Corporate Responsibility Coordinator*  
Maryknoll Sisters

Alan Spatrick  
*Managing Principal*  
Meketa Investment Group

Valerie Heinonen  
*Director, Shareholder Advocacy*  
Mercy Investments Services, Inc.

Alejando R Fernandez  
*Chairperson*  
Miami Firefighters' Relief & Pension Fund

Jay Youngdahl  
*Chairman, Board of Trustees*  
Middletown Works VEBA

Luan Jenifer  
*Executive Vice President*  
Miller/Howard Investments, Inc.

Mansco Perry III  
*Executive Director*  
Minnesota State Board of Investment

Bob Wyatt  
*Executive Director*  
The Muttart Foundation

Ronald Borst  
*Management Trustee*  
National Integrated Pension Plan

Hank Kim, Esq.  
*Executive Director & Counsel*  
NCPERS

Scott M. Stringer  
*New York City Comptroller*  
New York City Pension Funds

Thomas P. DiNapoli  
*New York State Comptroller*  
New York State Common Retirement Fund

Dan Rusnak  
*Trustee*  
Northern Nevada Laborers Pension Trust

Julie Goodridge  
*CEO*  
NorthStar Asset Management, Inc.

Judy Byron, OP  
Northwest Coalition for  
Responsible Investment

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 6

Denise L. Nappier  
*Connecticut State Treasurer*  
Office of the Connecticut State Treasurer

Seth M. Magaziner  
*General Treasurer, State of Rhode Island*  
Office of the General Treasurer

Michael Frerichs  
*Illinois State Treasurer*  
Office of the Illinois State Treasurer

Tobias Read  
*Oregon State Treasurer*  
Office of the Oregon Treasurer

Julie Gorte  
*Senior Vice President for  
Sustainable Investing*  
Pax World Funds

Brian Coughlin  
*Trustee*  
Philadelphia Board of Pensions

Mark Peters  
*Director of Justice, Peace  
and Reconciliation*  
Priests of the Sacred Heart, US Province

Catherine Cartier  
*President*  
Progressive Asset Management

Robert Baird  
*Director*  
Progressive Investment Management

Carsten Henningsen  
*Director*  
Progressive Investment Management

Michael Crosby  
*Corporate Responsibility Agent*  
Province of St. Joseph of the  
Capuchin Order

Loic Dessaint  
*CEO*  
Proxinvest

Craig Rosenberg  
*President*  
ProxyVote Plus, LLC

Ruth Schaaf, OP  
*Coordinator, Socially  
Responsible Investments*  
Racine Dominican Sisters

Jo Marie Chrosniak, HM  
*Coordinator*  
Region VI Coalition for  
Responsible Investment

Patricia Jurewicz  
*Director*  
Responsible Sourcing Network

Maria Arabatzis  
*Portfolio Manager and Shareholder  
Engagement Manager*  
Reynders, McVeigh Capital Management

Rozanna Patane  
*Owner*  
Rozanna Patane Financial Advisor LLC

Patti B. Dolan  
*Portfolio Manager*  
SAGE Investment Advisors  
Raymond James

Helen Ninos  
*Interim Executive Director*  
School Employees Retirement  
System of Ohio

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 7

Daniel Tretow  
*Director of Financial Services*  
School Sisters of St. Francis, Inc.

Jeffrey S. Davis  
*Executive Director*  
Seattle City Employees Retirement System

Maureen O'Brien  
*VP, Director of Corporate Governance*  
Segal Marco Advisors

Michael Crosby  
*Executive Director*  
Seventh Generation Interfaith Coalition  
for Responsible Investing

Peter Chapman  
*Executive Director*  
Shareholder Association for  
Research and Education

Richard Torgerson  
*CEO*  
SharePower Responsible Investing, Inc.

Sister Cecilia Hudec  
Sisters of Charity Halifax

James Weber  
Sisters of Charity of Cincinnati

Barbara Joseph Lammers, SCN  
*Corporate Responsibility Coordinator*  
Sisters of Charity of Nazareth

Margaret O'Brien  
*Congregation Treasurer*  
Sisters of Charity of New York

Mary Burns, SC  
*Congregation Representative*  
Sisters of Charity of Halifax

Denece Billesberger, sej  
*Treasurer*  
Sisters of Instruction of the Child Jesus

Sr Stella Chafe  
*Treasurer*  
Sisters of Saint Martha

Nora Nash  
*Director Corporate Social Responsibility*  
Sisters of St. Francis of Philadelphia

Elizabeth Cawley  
*Justice Promoter*  
Sisters of St. Joseph of Boston

Linda Hincken  
*CFO*  
Sisters of the Order of St Dominic

Ruth Geraets  
*Congregational Treasurer*  
Sisters of the Presentation of the  
Blessed Virgin Mary

Maureen Welsh  
*Justice Representative*  
Society of the Holy Child Jesus

Danielle Jezienicki  
*Impact Analyst*  
Sonen Capital

Julie Wyne  
*Retirement Administrator*  
Sonoma County Employees'  
Retirement Association

Euan Stirling  
*Head of Stewardship & ESG Investment*  
Standard Life Investments

Stephen Whipp  
*Managing Director*  
Stephen Whipp Financial

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 8

Anne Amanda Bangasser  
*Managing Director*  
Treehouse Investments LLC

Jonas Kron  
*Senior Vice President*  
Trillium Asset Management

Erik Breen  
*Manager SRI*  
Triodos Investment Management

Mary Beth Gallagher  
*Executive Director*  
Tri-State Coalition for  
Responsible Investment

Meredith Miller  
*Chief Corporate Governance Officer*  
UAW Retiree Medical Benefits Trust

Jon Dunn  
*Chair of Trustees*  
UNISON Staff Pension Scheme

Timothy Brennan  
*Treasurer & CFO*  
Unitarian Universalist Association

Erik Mathiesen  
*CFO*  
The United Church of Canada

Lisa Woll  
*CEO*  
US SIF: The Forum for Sustainable  
and Responsible Investment

Patricia Farrar-Rivas  
*CEO, Founding Partner*  
Veris Wealth Partners

Theresa Whitmarsh  
*Executive Director*  
Washington State Investment Board

Sonia Kowal  
*President*  
Zevin Asset Management